The international trading system has come under increasing attack by activists as being in conflict with human rights law, yet some have defended the system as contributing more to the fulfillment of human rights than many other areas of international law. This study examines the alleged conflict of WTO law with international human rights law, using one of the most prominent examples of such a conflict: the one that exists between international patent law, and access to medication as guaranteed by the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. This highly controversial political issue of the appropriate use of international patent law on life saving medicines gained the world’s attention during the discussion about the price of AIDS medication, but recent instances also include the availability of the patented medication for bird flu and for anthrax.

The book discusses both the patent law and the international human rights law involved in great depth, distinguishing between obligations under different human rights instruments and including a highly readable introduction into both areas of law. It then explains the concept of conflict between legal regimes and why patent law and human rights law are in conflict. The current state of international law on the conflict between legal regimes and the origin of such conflicts is analyzed, covering such issues as hierarchy in international law and introducing the concept of ‘factual hierarchy’. The book then turns to the role of human rights law in the WTO system, concluding that such law currently is limited to aiding the interpreting of the WTO agreements. It shows how a further integration of human rights law could be achieved and describes the progress made towards accommodating human rights concerns within the TRIPS Agreement, culminating in the first ever decision to amend a core WTO Agreement in December 2005.
Detailed Contents

Table of Cases (Selection)  xxi
Table of Laws and Treaties (Selection)  xxii
List of Abbreviations  xxvii
Introduction  xxxiii

1. Background of the Debate  1
   I Finding a Cure for a New Disease  2
   II BW’s Decision on AZT Pricing Causes Outrage  5
   III The HIV/AIDS Pandemic Today  6
   IV The TRIPS Agreement and Access to Medicine: The South African Medicines Act  11
   V Beyond AIDS Drugs: Anthrax and Cipro  15

2. Patent Law  18
   I A Short Primer on Patents  19
   II The History of Patent Law  20
      1 Patent Privileges  21
      2 The First Patent Acts  22
      3 The 19th Century  27
      4 The Patentability of Pharmaceutical Products  28
   III Rationales of Patent Law  29
      1 Natural Law Rationale  29
      2 Contract Rationale  30
      3 Reward Rationale  31
      4 Incentive Rationale  31
      5 Prospect Theory  32
   IV International Patent Law  33
      1 International Patent Law before the TRIPS Agreement  34
      2 Shortcomings of the Traditional System  36
      3 The North-South Divide: Arguments for and against Stronger Patent Protection  37
      4 Unilateral Pressure on Developing Countries  39
      5 The WTO/GATT setting  41
         A Background: The GATT  41
         B Intellectual Property in the GATT  43
         C The Uruguay Round  44
         D Validity of the TRIPS Agreement  48
V  TRIPS Agreement Patent Standards  
   1  Interpretation in Light of the Object and Purpose of the TRIPS Agreement  
   2  Basic Principles of the TRIPS Agreement  
   3  Conditions of Patentability  
      A  Patentable Subject Matter  
         a  Inventions  
         b  All Fields of Technology, Exceptions, Non-Discrimination  
            aa  All Fields of Technology  
            bb  Exceptions for Pharmaceuticals?  
            cc  Non-Discrimination  
            dd  The Drug Approval Process: Patent Law Implications  
         c  Product and Process Patents  
   B  Novelty  
   C  Inventive Step  
   D  Capability of Industrial Application  
   E  Disclosure  
   4  Rights Conferred  
   5  Transitional Arrangements  
   6  Conclusion on Patent Law  

3. Access to Medicine as a Human Right  

I  Background  
   1  International Human Rights  
   2  Health and Human Rights  
   3  Intellectual Property and Human Rights  

II  The Interpretation of Human Rights Conventions  

III  Justiciability  
   1  Terminology  
   2  Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights as Justiciable Rights  

IV  Who is Bound by International Human Rights Law?  
   1  Human Rights Obligations of Corporations  
   2  Human Rights Obligations of International Organizations  

V  Conventions  
   1  ICESCR  
      A  Access to Medicine as Part of the Right to Health  
         a  Content of the Right  
         b  Duties imposed on States Parties  
            aa  Obligation to Respect  
            bb  Obligation to Protect  
            cc  Obligation to Fulfil  
            dd  Justifying Non-Compliance with Lack of Financial Means  
      B  Enjoyment of the Benefits of Scientific Progress  
   2  The WHO  
   3  ICCPR
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A Content of the Right</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Duties Imposed on States Parties</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Universal Declaration of Human Rights</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Other Agreements</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI General International Law</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Customary International Law</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Treaties and Customary International Law</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B State Practice</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C <em>Opinio juris</em></td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 General Principles</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII Conclusion on Human Rights</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Conflict between Patents and Access to Medicine</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I Interference of Patents with Access to Medicine due to Price Effects</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Microeconomic Theory</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Competitive Market</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Monopoly Pricing</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Patents as Monopolies—other Pricing Factors</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D Pricing in Developing Countries</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Empirical Studies and Extrapolations</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Severity of the Access Impact</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Justification of the Interference</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Protection of the Inventor’s Material Interests</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Author—Scope <em>ratione personae</em></td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Interests of Inventors—Scope <em>ratione materiae</em></td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Moral and Material Interests</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D The Right in the Conflict with Access to Medicine</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Justification as an Incentive for Future Research</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Effects on Third Parties: Duty to Cooperate</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV A Conflict between the Patent and the Human Rights Regime?</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Conflict of International Legal Regimes: Terminology</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Fragmentation of International Law</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B International Legal Regimes</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Conflict</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a Definition of Conflict</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b Typologies of Conflicts</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Conflict of International Legal Regimes: Towards Hierarchy?</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Law of Coexistence and Reciprocity—A Law without Hierarchy</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Law of Cooperation and Community Interests—Hierarchy in International Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a <em>Erga Omnes</em> Obligations—Integral Treaties</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b <em>jus cogens</em></td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c Non-consenting States and Community Interests</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Institutionalization, Factual Hierarchy</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D ‘Soft-enforced’ Human Rights Meet ‘Hard-enforced’ WTO</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Access to Medicine as a Human Right in the WTO Order

I Access to Medicine as a Human Right within WTO
Dispute Settlement

1 Five Models for the Use of Non-WTO Law in WTO
Dispute Settlement

2 The WTO: A Self-contained Regime?

3 Jurisdiction
   A Violation Complaints
   B Non-Violation Complaints
   C De Lege Ferenda

4 Applicable Law
   A Examples of Provisions
   B Article 7 of the DSU
   C Article 11 of the DSU
   D Article 3.2 of the DSU
      a The Function of Article 3.2 of the DSU
      b The Approach Prescribed by the DSU: Use of International
         Law for Interpretation
      c Interpretation in Light of the Object and Purpose

5 Jurisprudence on Non-WTO Law in WTO Dispute Settlement
   A Treaties
   B General International Law

6 Access to Medicine as *jus cogens* within WTO Dispute Settlement?

II TRIPS Agreement Flexibilities in the Light of Human Rights

1 Parallel Imports
   A No International Exhaustion
   B Mandatory International Exhaustion
   C The Choice is Left to Members

2 Limited Exceptions
   A Limited
   B Conflict with Normal Exploitation
   C Prejudice Legitimate Interests
   D Article 27 of the TRIPS Agreement and Its Scope
   E Examples of Measures under Article 30 of the TRIPS Agreement
3 Compulsory Licences
   A Grounds for Granting Compulsory Licences
      a Local Working Requirements and Article 27 of the TRIPS Agreement
      b Commonly Suggested Grounds
   B Procedure of the Grant
      a Authorization on Individual Merits
      b Prior Negotiations
         aa The Requirement of Prior Negotiations
         bb Waiver of the Requirement
      c Adequate Remuneration
      d Review of the Decisions
   C Scope of the Rights under Compulsory Licences
      a Limited by the Purpose
      b Non-exclusive, Non-assignable
      c Territoriality
         aa Interpretation of the Provision
         bb Options for Members Lacking Pharmaceutical Manufacturing Capacity
   D Conclusion as to Compulsory Licences
4 Revocation of Patents
5 Conclusion

III WTO Decisions to Remedy Insufficiencies
1 The Doha Declaration
   A Negotiating History
   B Content of the Decision
2 The Decision of 30 August 2003
   A Negotiating History
   B Content of the Decision
      a Product Scope of the Decision
      b Country Scope
      c Waiver of Article 31(f) of the TRIPS Agreement
         aa Notification by Importing Member
         bb Conditions of Compulsory Licence Granted by Exporting Member
         cc Notification by Exporting Member
      d Waiver of Article 31(f) of the TRIPS Agreement within Regional Trade Agreements
      e Waiver of Article 31(h) of the TRIPS Agreement
      f Further Safeguards against Trade Diversion
      g Technicalities
   C Implementation
   D Evaluation
3 Amendment of the TRIPS Agreement
   A Negotiating History
Detailed Contents

B Content of the Decision 274
C Evaluation 275

4 The Legal Status of the Decisions: Flexibility in Decision-Making 276
    A Background: Decision-Making in the WTO 276
    B The Doha Declaration 279
    C The Decision of 30 August 2003 282
    D The Amendment of the TRIPS Agreement 286

5 Conclusion 286

IV Towards Solving the Conflict 287
    1 Possible Solutions 287
    2 Challenges Ahead: FTAs and BITs 289
        A Free Trade Agreements 289
        B Bilateral Investment Treaties 291
        C Conclusion 292

Annex 1: Summary of Arguments 293

Annex 2: States and their Membership in Relevant Organizations and Agreements 303

Annex 3: WTO Disputes on the TRIPS Agreement 308

Bibliography 312
Index 361