A Common Law of International Adjudication
Chester Dr. Brown

Description

The proliferation of international courts and tribunals has given rise to several new issues affecting the administration of international justice. This book makes a significant contribution to understanding the impact of this proliferation by addressing one important question: namely, whether international courts and tribunals are increasingly adopting common approaches to issues of procedure and remedies. This book's central argument is that there is an increasing commonality in the practice of international courts to the application of rules concerning these issues, and that this represents the emergence of a common law of international adjudication.

The book examines this question by considering several key issues relating to procedure and remedies, and analyzes relevant international jurisprudence to demonstrate that there is substantial commonality. It goes on to look at why international courts are increasingly adopting common approaches to such questions, and why a greater degree of commonality may be found with respect to some issues rather than others. In doing so, light is shed on the methods adopted by international courts to engage in the cross-fertilization of legal principles.

The emergence of a common law of international adjudication has important practical and theoretical implications, as it suggests that international courts can also devise common approaches to the challenges that they face in the age of proliferation. It also suggests that international courts do not generally operate as self-contained regimes, but rather that they regard themselves as forming part of a community of international courts, therefore having positive implications for the development of the international legal system.
Contents

Table of Cases xxi
Table of International Instruments xli
List of Abbreviations li

Introduction 1

I. Introduction to the Research Theme 1

II. Definitions and Scope 4
   A. On the Term 'Common Law of International Adjudication' 4
   B. On 'Procedure' and 'Remedies'
      1. 'Procedure' in International Adjudication 6
      2. 'Remedies' in International Adjudication 7
   C. Scope of the Book
      1. Aspects of International Adjudication 9
      2. Coverage of International Courts and Tribunals 10

III. Outline of the Book 12

1. The Emergence of a Common Law of International Adjudication against a Background of Proliferation and Fragmentation 15
   Introduction 15
   I. Proliferation of International Courts and Tribunals 17
   II. Reasons for Proliferation 22
   III. Proliferation and Fragmentation 23
      A. International Law as an "Anarchical" Domain? 23
      B. Proliferation as a Cause of Jurisdictional Competition and Fragmentation 25
         1. Overlapping Jurisdictions of International Courts 28
         2. Doctrinal Inconsistencies in the Jurisprudence of International Courts 29
      C. The International Law Commission's Consideration of Fragmentation 32
         Conclusion 33

2. Methods Used by International Courts and Tribunals to Engage in Cross-Fertilization 35
   Introduction 36
   I. Sources of Law relating to Procedure and Remedies 36
      A. Constitutive Instruments of International Courts 37
      B. Rules of Procedure of International Courts 38
## Contents

C. Sources of Law when International Courts are faced with *Lacunae*
   1. *Interpretation by International Courts of their Constitutive Instruments*  
   2. *Custom, International Judicial Practice, and General Principles of Law*  
   3. *Inherent Powers*  

II. Inherent Powers in International Adjudication
   A. The Concept of 'Inherent Powers'  
   B. Arguments against the Exercise of Inherent Powers by International Courts
      1. *The Exercise of Inherent Powers depends on Unlimited Compulsory Jurisdiction*  
      2. *International Courts can only exercise Expressly Conferred Powers*  

III. Inherent Powers in the Practice of International Courts  

IV. Source of Inherent Powers
   A. Inherent Powers are derived from General Principles of Law  
   B. *Inherent Powers are Implied Powers*  
   C. Inherent Powers are Derived from the Identity of Courts as Judicial Bodies  
   D. Inherent Powers are Necessary to Ensure the Performance of the Functions of International Courts  

V. Extent of the Inherent Powers of International Courts
   A. Functions of International Adjudication  
   B. Limitations on the Exercise of Inherent Powers  
   Conclusion  

3. Aspects of Evidence in International Adjudication  

   Introduction  

I. Sources of Rules of Evidence in International Law  
   A. Constitutive Instruments  
   B. Other Sources of Evidentiary Rules in International Adjudication
      1. *Rules of Procedure*  
      2. *General Principles of Law*  
      3. *Inherent Powers*  

II. Evidential Issues in International Adjudication  
   A. Admission of Evidence  
   B. Burden of Proof  
   C. Standard of Proof  
   D. Conclusion  

III. Powers of International Courts Regarding Evidence
   A. Judicial Notice of Facts  
   B. Power to Order the Production of Evidence
4. Power of International Courts to Grant Provisional Measures

I. Purpose of Provisional Measures in International Adjudication
II. Source of the Power to Grant Provisional Measures
A. Constitutive Instruments of International Courts
B. Rules of Procedure of International Courts
C. Power to Grant Provisional Measures as a General Principle of Law
D. Power to Grant Provisional Measures as an Inherent Power
   1. The Power is necessary to carry out the Functions of International Courts
   2. Practice of International Courts supporting the Existence of the Power
E. Limitations on the Power to Grant Provisional Measures
III. Common Features in the Exercise of the Power
A. Question of Jurisdiction over the Merits
B. Circumstances Relevant to the Granting of Provisional Measures
   1. Prevention of Irreparable Prejudice to the Rights of the Parties
   2. Urgency
   3. Other Factors
C. Binding Quality of Provisional Measures
D. Power to Grant Provisional Measures Ultra Petita or Proprio Motu
Conclusion

5. Power of International Courts to Interpret and Revise Judgments and Awards

I. Post-Adjudication Role of International Courts and Tribunals
A. Finality of Adjudication
B. Limits to the Principle of Finality
II. Source of the Powers of Interpretation and Revision
A. Constitutive Instruments of International Courts
   1. Power of Interpretation
   2. Power of Revision
B. Rules of Procedure of International Courts
   1. Power of Interpretation
   2. Power of Revision
III. Powers of Interpretation and Revision as Inherent Powers
A. Possible Objections to the Powers as Inherent Powers
Contents

B. Practice of International Courts supporting the Existence of the Powers 165
   1. Power of Interpretation 165
   2. Power of Revision 166
C. Exercise of Post-Adjudication Powers in WTO Dispute Settlement 171
D. Conclusion 173

IV. Issues relevant to the Exercise of the Powers of Interpretation and Revision 173
   A. Jurisdiction of the International Court hearing the Request 175
   B. Composition of the International Court hearing the Request 176
   C. Scope of the Powers 177
   D. Conditions for the Exercise of the Powers 178
      1. Power of Interpretation 178
      2. Power of Revision 179
   Conclusion 183

6. Remedies in International Adjudication 185
   Introduction 185
   I. Source of the Power to Award Remedies 187
   II. ‘Reparation’ as the Remedy in International Law 190
      A. Generally 190
      B. The Three Forms of Reparation 190
      C. Agreement and Disagreement in the Law of Remedies 192
   III. Forms of Reparation in Particular Disputes 195
      A. Restitution 195
      B. Compensation 198
         1. Compensation for Damage to the State 199
         2. Compensation for Injury to Private Property 200
         3. Compensation for Personal Injury 206
      C. Declaratory Judgments 208
      D. Mandatory or Consequential Orders 209
         1. An available remedy in International Adjudication? 209
         2. Practice of International Courts making such Orders 212
   IV. Remedies in WTO Dispute Settlement 216
      A. WTO Remedies as Lex Specialis 217
      B. Influence of Reparation in WTO Dispute Settlement 220
      Conclusion 223

7. A Common Law of International Adjudication: Reasons and Limitations 225
   Introduction 225
   I. Reasons for the Emerging Common Law of International Adjudication 226
Contents

II. Limitations to the Development of a Common Law of International Adjudication 234
   Conclusion 237

8. Implications of a Common Law of International Adjudication 238
   Introduction 238
   I. Practical Implications 239
      A. Generally 239
      B. Practical Implications with respect to Problems posed by Proliferation 240
         1. Power of Summary Dismissal 242
         2. Power to Suspend Proceedings 250
         3. Power to Enjoin Parties from pursuing Parallel Proceedings 252
      C. Conclusion 255
   II. Theoretical Implications 255
      Conclusion 258

Conclusion 260

Bibliography 263
Index 295