

#### Retribution and Reparation in the Transition to Democracy

The contributions in this volume offer a comprehensive analysis of transitional justice from 1945 to the present. They focus on retribution against the leaders and agents of autocratic regimes preceding democratic transitions and on reparation to victims. Part I contains general theoretical discussions of retribution and reparation. The essays in Part II survey transitional justice in the wake of World War II, covering Austria, Belgium, Denmark, France, Germany, Hungary, the Netherlands, and Norway. In Part III, the contributors discuss more recent transitions in Argentina, Chile, Eastern Europe, the former German Democratic Republic, and South Africa, with a chapter on the reparation of injustice in some of these transitions. The editor provides a general introduction, a brief introduction to each part, and a conclusion that looks beyond regime transitions to broader issues of rectifying historical injustice.

Jon Elster is Robert K. Merton Professor of Social Science in the Department of Political Science at Columbia University. He has also taught in Paris, Oslo, and Chicago. His publications include *Ulysses and the Sirens*, Sour Grapes, Making Sense of Marx, The Cement of Society, Solomonic Judgements, Nuts and Bolts for the Social Sciences, Local Justice, Political Psychology, Strong Feelings, Alchemies of the Mind, and Ulysses Unbound. His research interests include the theory of rational choice, the theory of distributive justice, and the history of social thought.



# Retribution and Reparation in the Transition to Democracy

Edited by

JON ELSTER

Columbia University





#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521829731

© Cambridge University Press 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Retribution and reparation in the transition to democracy / edited by Jon Elster.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-82973-9 (hardback)

1. Political crimes and offenses. 2. Justice and politics. 3. Ex post facto laws.

4. Restorative justice. I. Elster, Jon, 1940-

K5250.R48 2006 320'.01'I - dc22

2005009626

ISBN-13 978-0-521-82973-1 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-82973-9 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### Contents

Co	ntributors	page vii
Preface and Acknowledgments		ix
Ι	Introduction Jon Elster	I
PAF	RT I GENERAL ISSUES	15
2	How Far Back Should We Go? Why Restitution Should Be Small <i>Tyler Cowen</i>	17
3	Retribution Jon Elster	33
PART II GERMANY AND GERMAN-OCCUPIED COUNTRIES AFTER 1945		57
4	Transitional Justice in Divided Germany after 1945 David Cohen	59
5	The Purge in France: An Incomplete Story Henry Rousso	89
6	Political Justice in Austria and Hungary after World War II István Deák	124
7	Dealing with the Past in Scandinavia: Legal Purges and Popular Memories of Nazism and World War II in Denmark and Norway after 1945 Hans Fredrik Dahl	147
8	Belgian and Dutch Purges after World War II Compared Luc Huyse	164

v



vi		Contents
PAF	AT III LATIN AMERICA, POST COMMUNISM, AND SOUTH AFRICA	179
9	Paranoids May Be Persecuted: Post-totalitarian Transitional Justice  Aviezer Tucker	181
10	Transitional Justice in Argentina and Chile: A Never-Ending Story?  Carlos H. Acuña	206
II	Transitional Justice in the German Democratic Republic and in Unified Germany  Claus Offe and Ulrike Poppe	239
12	Rough Justice: Rectification in Post-authoritarian and Post-totalitarian Regimes Aviezer Tucker	276
13	Truth and Reconciliation Commission in South Africa Amnesty: The Price of Peace Alex Boraine	299
14	Conclusion Jon Elster	317
Index		329



#### Contributors

Carlos H. Acuña, Departamento de Humanidades, Universidad de San Andrés, Buenos Aires

Alex Boraine, International Center for Transitional Justice, New York, New York

**David Cohen**, Departments of Rhetoric and Classics, University of California, Berkeley

Tyler Cowen, Department of Economics, George Mason University, Fairfax, Virginia

Hans Fredrik Dahl, Institute of Media & Communication, University of Oslo

István Deák, Columbia University, New York, New York

Jon Elster, Department of Political Science, Columbia University, New York, New York

Luc Huyse, Leuven University Law School

Claus Offe, Department of Political Science, Humboldt University, Berlin

Ulrike Poppe, Contemporary History Studies, Evangelische Akademie, Berlin

Henry Rousso, Institut d'histoire du temps present, École normale supérieure de Cachan

**Aviezer Tucker**, Department of Social and Political Theory, Australian National University, Canberra



## Preface and Acknowledgments

Most of the chapters in this volume originated in a seminar on retroactive justice (the now-standard term *transitional justice* had not yet taken hold) held at Columbia University in 1998–99. To improve the balance of the volume, two additional contributions have been included. The chapter by David Cohen on transitional justice in Germany after 1945 was specially written for this volume. To cover the trials and purges that took place in France after the Liberation in 1944, there was no better solution than to translate the most up-to-date essay by the foremost specialist on the topic, Henry Rousso. My own editorial contributions have been kept relatively brief, to reduce the overlap with my monograph *Closing the Books: Transitional Justice in Historical Perspective* (Cambridge University Press, 2004). Because I thought the present book should also be able to stand on its own, however, some redundancy was inevitable.

My thanks go first to the Mellon Foundation for its generous support of the Columbia seminar and of other related activities. I am also grateful to the Research Council of Norway for offering a subvention to cover the costs of translating Henry Rousso's essay and other publishing expenses. I would also like to thank the anonymous referees of Cambridge University Press, who pointed out the need for the chapters on Germany and France, as well as making a number of other valuable comments. Monika Nalepa offered superb research assistance. Finally, I would like to offer thanks to my collaborator over four decades, Hans Fredrik Dahl, who joined me in this effort as in so many others.

J.E. Villiers-Nonains, September 2005