

Sexual Orientation: A Human Right

An Essay on International Human Rights Law

by

ERIC HEINZE



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LONDON

CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS	xix
PART ONE: THE OLDEST AND NEWEST OF PROBLEMS	1
Chapter 1: Less Equal?	3
1.1 The Human Rights Context	10
1.2 Synopsis	22
1.3 Purposes	27
Chapter 2: Sexual Orientation and Sexual Minorities	31
2.1 The Normative-Heterosexual Paradigm of Social Organization	31
2.2 The Emergence of Sexual Minorities	37
2.3 The Concept of Sexual Orientation	44
2.4 The Concept of Sexual Minorities	50
2.4.1 The General Concept of Minorities	50
2.4.2 The General Concept Applied to Sexual Minorities	53
2.5 Definitions	59
PART 2: FROM WESTERN CONCEPTS TO UNIVERSAL LAW?	63
Chapter 3: The Problem of Universality	67
3.1 The Analogy to Universal Human Rights Law in General	67
3.2 The Analogy to the Social Sciences in General	75
Chapter 4: Rights, New and Old	79
4.1 Three Generations of Rights	80
4.2 Historical Location of Rights of Sexual Orientation . . .	84
Chapter 5: Practical Concerns	89
5.1 The Political Functions of Human Rights Law	90
5.2 The Moral, Symbolic and Didactic Functions of Human Rights Law	92

Chapter 6: Rights of Sexual Orientation in the World Today	105
6.1 The Expansive Recognition Model	106
6.2 The Intermediate Recognition Model	110
6.3 The Minimum Recognition Model	111
6.4 The Mixed Recognition Model	112
PART 3: METHODOLOGY	117
Chapter 7: Rights, New and Extant	121
7.1 The Positivist Approach	121
7.2 The Naturalist Approach	125
7.3 The Dialectic of Positivism and Naturalism	129
Chapter 8: Jurisprudential Foundations	131
8.1 The Principle of Strict Egalitarianism	132
8.2 The Principle of Extant Rights	135
8.3 The Principle of Fundamental Rights	142
8.4 General Rule	144
PART 4: FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS OF SEXUAL ORIENTATION	153
Chapter 9: Personhood	157
9.1 Sexuality, Sexual Orientation, and Personhood	157
9.2 The Role of the Social Sciences	162
Chapter 10: Privacy	171
10.1 Aspects of the Right	172
10.1.1 The Decisional Aspect	173
10.1.2 The Spatial Aspect	175
10.2 Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights	175
10.3 Jurisprudence of the United States Supreme Court	178
10.3.1 The Decisional Aspect Applied to Private, Consensual, Sexual Acts	183
10.3.2 The Spatial Aspect Applied to Private, Consensual, Sexual Acts	184
Chapter 11: Liberty	187
11.1 Three Conditions of Liberty	187
11.1.1 <i>Neminem laedere</i>	187
11.1.2 Palpable Harm	188
11.1.3 Denial and Limitation	192

11.2 Unjustified Limits on Rights of Sexual Orientation	193
11.2.1 Jurisprudence of the United States Supreme Court	193
11.2.2 Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights	196
11.2.3 Sham Limitations	208
11.2.4 The Right to Be Different	209
11.3 Justified Limits on Rights of Sexual Orientation	210
Chapter 12: Equality	215
12.1 Sex, Gender, and Sexual Orientation	216
12.2 General and Specific Equality	220
12.3 The Jurisprudence of "New" Categories	221
12.4 Discrimination	225
12.4.1 Invidious Treatment	226
12.4.2 Systemic Discrimination	227
12.5 A Sample Model	229
12.5.1 Levels of Scrutiny	231
12.5.2 Sexual Orientation as a Suspect Classification	233
12.6 Equality: Between Hegemony and Subsidiarity	236
Chapter 13: Towards a Jurisprudence of Sexual Minorities	243
13.1 The Legal Concept of Minorities	244
13.1.1 Varieties of Rights	245
13.1.2 Minority Rights	247
13.1.3 Definitions	249
13.2 Towards a Legal Concept of Sexual Minorities	253
Chapter 14: Other Rights	259
14.1 The Scope of Rights: Third-Party Applicability (<i>Drittwirkung</i>)	259
14.2 Rights against Inhuman or Degrading Treatment	262
14.3 Rights of Thought and Conscience	264
14.4 Rights of Speech and Expression	266
14.4.1 Sexual Minorities as "Subjects" of Speech and Expression	266
14.4.2 Sexual Minorities as "Objects" of Speech and Expression	268
14.5 Rights of Association	270
14.6 Criminal Law	272
14.6.1 Sexual Minorities as "Subjects" of Criminal Law	272
14.6.2 Sexual Minorities as "Objects" of Criminal Law	277

14.7 Employment Rights	278
14.7.1 Public Employment	278
14.7.2 Private Employment	281
14.8 Goods and Services	282
14.9 Sexual Orientation and Young People	282
14.9.1 Young People as "Subjects" of Rights of Sexual Orientation	283
14.9.2 Young People as "Objects" of Rights of Sexual Orientation	283
14.10 Travel, Immigration and Asylum	286
 PART 5: TOWARDS POSITIVE LAW	 287
 Chapter 15: A Model Declaration	 289
 Chapter 16: Recommendations	 305
16.1 Further Research	305
16.2 Further Action	306
 APPENDIX — Excerpts from International Human Rights Instruments	 309
 WORKS CITED	 355
1. Cases	355
2. Books	357
3. Articles and Other Works	368
 INDEX	 391

Unless otherwise specified, all translations of foreign texts into English are the author's.