IMPLEMENTATION OF THE EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS AND OF THE JUDGMENTS OF THE ECtHR IN NATIONAL CASE-LAW

A comparative analysis

Janneke GERARDS
Joseph FLEUREN
(eds.)
CONTENTS

Summary of Contents ................................................................. v
Contributors .................................................................................... xvii
Abbreviations .................................................................................... xix

Chapter 1. Introduction
Janneke GERARDS and Joseph Pleuren ........................................ 1

1. Evolutive interpretation, national courts and the legitimacy of the
European Court of Human Rights ............................................... 1
  1.1. The constitutional competences of national courts to implement
      the Court's case-law ......................................................... 6
  1.2. Main research questions .................................................... 8

2. Approach and methodology ..................................................... 9
  2.1. Overall approach ............................................................ 9
  2.2. The comparative analysis: selection of states and approach ..... 10
      2.2.1. Selection of states .................................................. 10
      2.2.2. Approach of the comparative study ......................... 11

3. Outline of the book .................................................................. 11

Chapter 2. The European Court of Human Rights and the national courts:
giving shape to the notion of 'shared responsibility'
Janneke GERARDS ...................................................................... 13

1. Introduction ............................................................................. 13

2. The Court's raison d'être ......................................................... 15
   2.1. Introduction .................................................................... 15
   2.2. Functions and tasks of the Court ................................... 15
   2.3. Subsidiarity, primarity and diversity ............................. 17
   2.4. The 'push' and 'pull' factors in the Court's work ............. 19

3. The shared responsibility of the Court and the national courts ... 21
   3.1. Introduction .................................................................... 21
   3.2. Erga omnes effect and res interpretata ........................... 21
   3.3. The national courts' obligation to comply with the Convention
        and the Court's interpretations ....................................... 23
   3.4. The margin of appreciation doctrine and its (ir)relevance for
        national courts ............................................................... 27
**Chapter 3. Belgium**

Guan Schaiko, Paul Lemmens and Koen Lemmens

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2.1</td>
<td>Legislative acts</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2.2</td>
<td>Administrative acts</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.1</td>
<td>Legislative acts</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.2</td>
<td>Administrative acts</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>Legislative acts</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>Administrative acts</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Implementation of the European Convention on Human Rights by national courts</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1</td>
<td>The direct effect of the ECHR in the Belgian legal order</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2</td>
<td>The practice of the Belgian courts</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2.1</td>
<td>Practice with respect to legislative acts</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

Chapter 4. France
Céline LAGEOT .................................................. 145

1. Introduction: a brief characterisation of the French constitutional system .................................................. 145
   1.1. Separation and balance of powers .................................................. 145
   1.2. Unitariness and decentralisation .................................................. 147
   1.3. Organisation of the judicial power .................................................. 148
   1.4. Fundamental rights .................................................. 151
2. Constitutional review in France: the role of the Constitutional Council .................................................. 152
3. The status of international law and the ECHR in the French constitutional order .................................................. 155
   3.1. Monism and the binding character of international law .................................................. 155
   3.2. Status of international law in the hierarchy of norms .................................................. 156
   3.3. The direct effect of the ECHR and its substantive protocols .................................................. 157
4. Judicial competences to review the compatibility of norms with international law .................................................. 158
   4.1. The development of decentralised 'conventionality' review .................................................. 158
   4.2. The role of the Constitutional Council: a priori review .................................................. 160
   4.3. The competence of the courts to give priority to international law .................................................. 161
5. The application of ECHR provisions by French courts .................................................. 162
   5.1. Review of national legislation and decisions for compatibility with the ECHR .................................................. 163

Chapter 5. Germany
Eckart KLEIN .................................................. 185

1. The constitutional system .................................................. 185
   1.1. Basics .................................................. 185
   1.2. Federal organs .................................................. 185
   1.3. The Federation and the Länder .................................................. 186
   1.4. The court system .................................................. 186
   1.5. Constitutional rights of the individual .................................................. 187
   1.6. Constitutional openness to international law .................................................. 189
2. Status of international law in domestic law .................................................. 189
   2.1. Position of international law in German law .................................................. 189
   2.2. Incorporation theories .................................................. 190
   2.3. EU law .................................................. 191
   2.4. Emanations of international organisations .................................................. 191
Chapter 6. The Netherlands
Janneke Gerards and Joseph Fleuret

1. Introduction: constitutional background
2. Status of international law in domestic law
   2.1. The constitutional system for giving effect to international law
   2.2. Self-executing provisions

3. Judicial review
   3.1. Constitutional review: the role of the Federal Constitutional Court
   3.2. Ex post review as principle
   3.3. Possible collisions between international and domestic law
   4. Decisions of international organisations

4. Implementation of the European Convention on Human Rights by national courts
   4.1. Direct applicability of Convention rights
   4.2. Invocability of Convention rights
   4.3. Harmonising interpretation of domestic law
   4.4. Reactions to judgments not directed against Germany
   4.5. Reactions to judgments directed against Germany
   4.6. Margin of appreciation doctrine

5. The impact of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights on national judicial decision making
   5.1. Status of ECtHR judgments in national law
   5.2. Reaction to judgments directed against Germany
   5.3. Complying with the judgments and decisions of the ECtHR
   5.4. Application of standards developed by the ECtHR
   5.5. Taking account of the role of the judiciary and the limited judicial competences
   5.6. Margin of appreciation doctrine

6. Legitimacy debates: the ECtHR and the national courts
   6.1. Discussion on the role of the ECtHR in Germany
   6.2. Discussions de lege ferenda

7. Conclusions
   7.1. Connection between the features of the constitutional system and the impact of the Convention and the ECtHR judgments
   7.2. Primary role of constitutional basic rights in daily practice
   7.3. Impact of the discussions about the impact of the ECtHR on national case-law
   7.4. Relation between the debate on the ECtHR and the domestic implementation of international law

Chapter 7. Sweden
Iain Cameron and Thomas Bull

1. Introduction: constitutional background
   1.1. General constitutional structure
   1.2. Protection of fundamental rights

3.3.3. Frequency of references to Strasbourg case-law; acceptance of *res interpretata* ........................................ 357
3.3.4. Adjusting national case-law because of ECtHR precedents ........................................ 358
3.3.5. 'Positive deviations' and the application of the 'mirror principle' ........................................ 360
3.3.6. Adopting typical Convention doctrines ........................................ 361
3.3.7. Taking constitutional competences seriously: judicial restraint ........................................ 363
3.3.8. Conclusion ........................................ 364

4. Debate about the Court and its case-law ........................................ 366
4.1. Introduction ........................................ 366
4.2. Dealing with national criticism and national debates by the Court ........................................ 366
4.3. Criticism in the states ........................................ 368
4.4. Conclusion ........................................ 369

5. Conclusions ........................................ 370

*Appendix* ........................................ 375