

NON-INTERNATIONAL  
ARMED CONFLICTS IN  
INTERNATIONAL LAW

YORAM DINSTEIN



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	page	xiii
<i>Table of cases</i>		xv
<i>Table of treaties</i>		xviii
<i>Table of Security Council resolutions</i>		xxvi
<i>Table of General Assembly resolutions</i>		xxvii
<i>Abbreviations</i>		xxviii
<b>1</b>	<b>The framework</b>	<b>1</b>
	I. Introduction	1
	A. NIACs and IACs	1
	B. LONIAC	3
	C. No NIAC <i>jus ad bellum</i>	4
	II. The legal strata of NIAC law	6
	A. Treaty law	6
	B. Customary international law	9
	III. The triple classification of violence during a NIAC	11
	A. Hostilities	11
	B. Ordinary crimes	12
	C. War crimes	13
	D. The triple classification and wilful killing	16
	E. The disparate perspectives of domestic and international law	16
	IV. Motives and goals of a NIAC	17
	A. Motives	17
	B. Goals	18
<b>2</b>	<b>The preconditions of a NIAC</b>	<b>20</b>
	I. NIACs as armed conflicts	20
	II. NIACs distinguished from internal disturbances	21
	A. Isolated and sporadic acts of violence	21
	B. The law enforcement paradigm	22

III. The dichotomy of NIACs and IACs	23
IV. The territorial dimensions of NIACs	24
A. A NIAC as an armed conflict within the territory of a single State	24
(a) The internal character of a NIAC	24
(b) Extra-territorial spillover	25
(i) The high seas	25
(ii) Cyber space	26
(iii) Cross-border hostilities on land	26
(c) The 'war' on terrorism	27
(d) Divided nations	27
V. A clash between organized armed groups <i>inter se</i>	28
V. A modicum of organization of the insurgents	30
A. Insurgency distinguished from mob violence	30
B. Insurgents as a party to the conflict	31
VII. Protracted violence	32
A. The temporal element	32
B. Revolutions and <i>coups d'Etat</i>	33
C. How much time is required?	33
VIII. Intensity of the fighting	34
A. Terrorist activities	34
B. Intensity as an independent criterion	34
C. Indicia of intensity	35
<b>3 Thresholds and interaction of armed conflicts</b>	<b>37</b>
I. The thresholds of armed conflicts	37
A. Below-the-threshold violence	37
B. Over the first threshold	38
C. Over the second threshold	39
(a) Government armed forces	40
(b) Dissident armed forces	40
(c) Other organized armed groups under responsible command	41
(i) The constituent elements	41
(ii) The five factors of organization	43
(d) Control over territory	45
(e) Sustained and concerted military operations	46
(f) Capacity to implement AP/II	47
(g) Permutations	47
D. The end of a NIAC	48
E. Over the third threshold	50
II. Interaction between armed conflicts	52

A. Two or more NIACs	52
B. Combinations of NIACs and IACs	54
(a) Simultaneous combinations	54
(b) Consecutive combinations	55
<b>4 Insurgent armed groups and individuals</b>	<b>58</b>
I. Direct participation in hostilities	58
A. The concept	58
B. The meaning	60
(a) Activities	60
(b) Members of organized armed groups	61
(c) Individuals	62
II. Why are insurgent armed groups bound by LONIAC?	63
A. The axiom	63
B. The rationale	64
(a) Treaty law	64
(i) Non-State bearers of obligations and rights	65
(ii) Non-State actors and treaties	68
(iii) Agreements between Governments and insurgents	70
(b) Customary international law	72
<b>5 Foreign intervention in a NIAC</b>	<b>74</b>
I. The principle of non-intervention	74
A. The principle and the practice	74
B. 'R2P'	75
II. Military intervention by a foreign State in support of the incumbent Government	76
A. The requirement of consent	76
(a) Consent as a door-opener to foreign intervention	76
(b) The position of the <i>Institut de Droit International</i>	76
(c) The general practice of States	78
(d) The validity and parameters of consent	79
(e) Consent by treaty	81
(f) Revocation of consent	81
(g) Constraints	82
B. 'Failing States'	83
III. Military intervention by a foreign State against the incumbent Government	84
A. Use of <i>de facto</i> organs	84
B. Military assistance to insurgents	84
IV. The applicable law	86
A. LONIAC or IAC <i>jus in bello</i> ?	86

B. Some outstanding problems	87
V. Intervention by the Security Council in a NIAC	88
A. The UN Charter	88
B. The case of Libya	90
C. The range of the Security Council's intervention	91
D. Peacekeeping forces	93
<b>6 Recognition</b>	<b>95</b>
I. Recognition of an insurgent Government	95
A. Conditions for the existence of a State and a Government	95
B. Recognition of a new Government	96
C. Issues related to recognition of Governments	98
(a) The three main scenarios	98
(b) Formation of an insurgent Government	98
(c) Only one Government can be recognized at any given time	99
(d) Premature and artificially prolonged recognition	99
(e) <i>De facto</i> recognition	100
(f) Implied recognition	101
(g) Recognition as a step towards intervention	102
(h) Democracy and constitutionality	103
(i) Avoiding recognition	104
(j) Government-in-exile	105
D. Action by the Security Council	106
II. Recognition of a new State	107
III. 'Recognition of belligerency'	108
A. 'Recognition of belligerency' by the incumbent Government	108
B. 'Recognition of belligerency' by foreign States	109
C. Implied 'recognition of belligerency'	111
(a) By the incumbent Government	111
(b) By foreign States	113
IV. 'Recognition of insurgency'	113
<b>7 State responsibility</b>	<b>115</b>
I. The ILC Draft Articles	115
II. Attribution of acts to the State	116
A. Organs of the State	116
B. Private persons	117
C. <i>Ultra vires</i> acts	117
III. Due diligence	118
A. The concept	118

B. Prevention	118
C. Punishment	120
IV. Mob violence and riots	120
A. Reasonable precautions	120
B. Attacks against foreigners	121
V. Insurgency	122
A. Unsuccessful insurgents	123
(a) Non-attribution to the State of insurgent acts	123
(b) Failure to exercise due diligence	124
(c) <i>Force majeure</i>	125
B. Successful insurgents	126
(a) A new Government	126
(i) Attribution of insurgent acts	126
(ii) Retroactivity	127
(iii) Limitations	127
(iv) Dual attribution	128
(v) Change of Governments	129
(b) A new State	129
VI. Foreign intervention	130
A. Responsibility of the foreign State for acts of its organs	130
B. Vicarious responsibility	131
<b>8 The principal LONIAC treaty provisions</b>	<b>132</b>
I. Common Article 3	132
A. The text	132
B. Analysis	133
II. AP/II	136
A. Comparisons	136
(a) AP/II and Common Article 3	136
(b) AP/II and AP/I	137
B. Humane treatment	139
(a) Fundamental guarantees	139
(i) Collective punishments and belligerent reprisals	140
(ii) The protection of children	142
(b) Internment	143
(c) Penal prosecutions	143
C. Wounded, sick and shipwrecked	145
(a) Protection and care	145
(b) Medical and religious personnel	146
(c) The emblem	147
D. The civilian population	147
(a) Protection from attack	147
(b) Starvation of civilians	149

	(c) Works or installations containing dangerous forces	149
	(d) Cultural property	150
	(e) Forced movement of civilians	150
	(f) Relief action	151
<b>9</b>	<b>Additional treaty texts</b>	<b>154</b>
	I. Treaties explicitly apposite to NIACs	154
	A. Cultural property	154
	B. Weapons	155
	C. Child-soldiers	157
	II. Treaties implicitly apposite to NIACs	159
	A. Enforced disappearances	159
	B. Weapons treaties	159
	(a) Biological weapons	159
	(b) Chemical weapons	160
	(c) Other weapons	161
	III. Search for definitions	161
	A. IAC definitions	162
	(a) Attacks	162
	(b) Wounded, sick and shipwrecked	162
	(c) <i>Hors de combat</i>	164
	(d) Medical and religious personnel	164
	(e) Medical units and transports	165
	B. General treaty definitions	165
	(a) Slavery and the slave trade	166
	(b) Torture	167
	(c) Taking of hostages	169
	(d) Acts of terrorism	171
<b>10</b>	<b>NIAC war crimes</b>	<b>173</b>
	I. Individual criminal responsibility	173
	A. The nexus to a NIAC	173
	(a) Crimes against humanity and genocide	173
	(b) The growth of NIAC war crimes	174
	B. The Statutes of the <i>ad hoc</i> international tribunals	175
	II. The Rome Statute of the ICC	177
	A. NIAC war crimes based on Common Article 3	178
	(a) The crimes	178
	(b) Scope of application	181
	B. Additional NIAC war crimes	181
	(a) The crimes	181
	(b) Analysis	182
	(c) Interaction with AP/II	188

	(d) Scope of application	190
	(e) The Kampala amendment	192
III.	The Second Protocol to the CPCP	193
IV.	Prosecution in a foreign State and extradition	194
	A. Universal jurisdiction	195
	B. Extradition	196
	(a) Political offences	196
	(b) NIAC war crimes	197
V.	Post-NIAC amnesties	199
	A. AP/II on amnesty	200
	B. Amnesty and impunity	201
	(a) The validity of an amnesty for NIAC war crimes	201
	(b) The Rome Statute of the ICC	203
	(c) The exercise of universal jurisdiction	204
<b>11</b>	<b>LONIAN customary international law</b>	<b>205</b>
	I. The evolution of LONIAN customary law	205
	A. The pace of the evolution	205
	B. <i>Lex lata</i> and <i>lex ferenda</i>	205
	II. The temporal and spatial scope of application	206
	III. The customary standing of LONIAN treaty provisions (beyond Common Article 3)	207
	A. AP/II	207
	B. Other treaties	209
	(a) Weapons	209
	(b) Cultural property	210
	IV. The process of osmosis from IAC <i>jus in bello</i>	211
	A. Convergence of LONIAN and IAC <i>jus in bello</i> ?	211
	B. General principles	213
	(a) Distinction	213
	(b) Unnecessary suffering	215
	C. Specific norms	216
	(a) Indiscriminate attacks	216
	(b) Proportionality	217
	(c) Precautions	218
	(d) Perfidy	218
	V. Divergence from IAC <i>jus in bello</i>	219
	A. POW status	219
	B. Neutrality	221
	C. Additional hurdles	222

12	<b>LONIAC and human rights law</b>	224
	I. The inter-relationship between LONIAC and human rights law	224
	A. Coexistence of LONIAC with human rights law	227
	B. LONIAC as <i>lex specialis</i>	227
	C. Derogations from human rights	230
	(a) The right to derogate	230
	(b) Non-use of the right to derogate	231
	(c) Non-derogable human rights	232
	D. Limitations built into human rights	233
	II. Some concrete aspects of interaction between LONIAC and human rights law	234
	A. Human rights law within LONIAC	235
	B. Human rights treaties <i>dehors</i> LONIAC	237
	(a) Explicit impact	237
	(b) Implicit impact	239
	III. Non-discrimination	240
	A. Illicit grounds of discrimination	240
	B. Nationality	241
	IV. Refugees and 'non-refoulement'	241
	A. The flow of refugees	241
	B. Refugees and war crimes	243
	C. Fear of persecution	243
	D. 'Non-refoulement'	244
	<i>Conclusions</i>	246
	<i>Index of persons</i>	249
	<i>Index of subjects</i>	254